

EXHIBIT 1

~~FILED UNDER SEAL~~

PUBLIC REDACTED
VERSION

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
		The Times's Proposed Search Terms	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		OpenAI's Initial Search Term Proposal	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		Court's Ruling
1	Unique, De-duplicated Hit Counts for all Terms Combined		546,902			131,601		
2								
3								
4	Section A: Terms Relating to the Products' Outputs							
5								
6	1	paywall	861		N/A			
7	2	antiregurg*	525		N/A			
8	3	regurg*	86		regurg* AND (ChatGPT OR GPT-3.5 OR GPT-3.5T OR "GPT-3.5 turbo" OR GPT-4 OR GPT-4T OR "GPT-4 turbo") AND copyright*	431		
9	4	(Bing* w/5 index) OR (search w/5 index) OR (search w/5 result*) OR (ranking* w/5 engine) OR ((knowledge OR entity) w/5 graph) OR ((prompt* OR query) w/5 logs) OR (user w/5 (queries OR prompt*))	47,148	N/A				
10	5	Retriev* w/15 ("based model" OR knowledge OR document* OR information)	13,679	N/A				
11	6	(retriev* w/5 augmen*) OR RAG	69		"Retrieval Augmented Generation"	169		
12	7				RAG	1,301		
13	8	(generat* OR ground* OR synthetic OR semantic OR deriv*) w/25 search*	16,979	N/A				
14	9		5,277		AND (ChatGPT OR GPT-3.5 OR GPT-3.5T OR "GPT-3.5 turbo" OR GPT-4 OR GPT-4T OR "GPT-4 turbo")	1,147		
15								
16	Section B: Terms Related to GenAI and Journalism							
17								
18	11	"NY Times" OR NYT OR "New York Times" OR "The Times" OR "nytimes" OR "The Athletic" OR "theathletic" OR "wirecutter"	11,572		(ChatGPT OR GPT-3.5 OR GPT-3.5T OR "GPT-3.5 turbo" OR GPT-4 OR GPT-4T OR "GPT-4 turbo") w/25 ("New York Times" OR NYTimes OR NYT OR "NY Times")	1,169		
19	12	(ethic* w/5 committee) OR (ethic* w/5 audit) OR (ethic* w/5 review) OR "ethic* Team" OR (red w/5 team*) OR "AI impact assessment" OR Aether OR "pre-deployment reviews" OR "stress testing" OR "responsible AI" OR RAI OR "Python Risk Identification Tool" OR PyRIT OR (compliance w/5 audit) OR (compliance w/5 committee)	28,300	N/A				
20	13	(Traffic OR search* OR clickthrough OR click-through OR "click through" OR CTR) w/25 (*GPT* OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR genai OR generative OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai OR SLM OR Microsoft OR Msft OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*)	33,819	N/A				
21	Section C: Terms Relating to The Times's Legal Claims							
22								
23	14	(Concern* OR importan* OR valu* OR need* OR neces* OR *legal* OR *law* OR complain* OR claim* OR infringe* OR violat* OR right* OR "intellectual property" OR IP) w/50 (*gpt* OR dv3 OR generative OR genai OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR Microsoft OR Msft OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*)	147,731	N/A				
24	15	Copyright* OR © OR © OR DRM OR "digital rights management" OR (fair w/5 use)	25,747		copyright* w/5 (search* OR clearance*)	63,863		
25	16	(Trademark* OR TM OR Lanham OR dilut* OR tarnish* OR ™ OR &trade OR ® OR ®) w/25						
26	17	(*gpt* OR dv3 OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai OR Microsoft OR Msft)	1,437	N/A				
27	18	Copy* w/5 Shield	3	N/A				
28	19	Indemni*	3,226	N/A				
29	20	((IP OR "intellectual property" OR copy*) AND (police* OR procedure* OR practice* OR conduct* OR action* OR guidance* OR guideline* OR SOP OR "standing operating procedure")) w/25 (*gpt* OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai OR Microsoft OR Msft OR transformer OR "neural network*" OR "machine learning" OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*)	1,045	N/A				
30	21	CMI OR DMCA OR 1202 OR watermark* OR (copyright w/5 management)	19,492		N/A			
31	22	data w/25 filter*	18,890		(filter* OR mask*) w/10 (train* w/10 (ChatGPT OR GPT-3.5 OR GPT-3.5T OR "GPT-3.5 turbo" OR GPT-4 OR GPT-4T OR "GPT-4 turbo"))	73		
32	23	(misuse w/3 detect*) OR (domain w/3 filter) OR (action w/3 monitor*) OR (us* w/3 polic*)	16,258	N/A				
33	24	(sketchy OR *reliab* OR *trust*) w/15 (data OR content* OR safety OR polic*)	24,378	N/A				
34	25	(content OR safety OR policy) w/25 (filter* OR mask*)	17,085	N/A				
35	Section D: Terms Relating to Model Training							
36	25	(*train* OR "fine tun*" OR fine-tun* OR finetun* OR instruct* OR *param* OR corpus OR corpora OR token* OR RLHF OR "proximal policy optimization" OR "data set" OR dataset* OR "test data") w/25 (discriminator OR curricular* OR classif* OR *score* OR frequen* OR contamination* OR duplicat* OR regression* OR cluster* OR feature* OR label* OR attribute* OR categ* OR value* OR variable* OR inference OR distillation OR recipe*)	221,351		book* w/5 (source* OR train* OR data* OR collection)	21,541		
37	26	(*train* OR "fine tun*" OR fine-tun* OR finetun* OR instruct* OR *param* OR corpus OR corpora OR token* OR RLHF OR "proximal policy optimization" OR "data set" OR dataset* OR "test data") w/25 (rule* OR guidance* OR weight* OR perplexity OR ROUGE OR F1 OR classif* OR benchmark OR whitelist OR blacklist OR safeguard* OR guardrail* OR quality OR recitation* OR scrap* OR checkpoint)	130,910	See row above				

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
		The Times's Proposed Search Terms	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		OpenAI's Initial Search Term Proposal	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		Court's Ruling
1								
2		Unique, De-duplicated Hit Counts for all Terms Combined	546,902			131,601		
38	27	data w/10 (clean* OR "process" OR curat* OR select* OR augment* OR sampl* OR gather* OR copy* OR publish*)	71,644	N/A				
39	28	(CC NOT w/25 (.com OR (To AND BCC))) w/50 (data OR content OR "train" OR dataset* OR "gpt" OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*)	123,352	N/A				
40	29	(train* OR stage* OR layer*) w/5 (learn* OR iteration OR cycle OR batch OR epoch)	30,177	N/A				
41	30	C4	13,205	N/A				
42	31	webtext* OR WT OR WT2	5,792		webtext	7,087		
43	32				commoncrawl OR "common crawl"	7,669		
44	33	("gpt" OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*) w/50 (journal* OR news* OR report* OR info* OR knowledge OR article* OR story OR stories OR publish* OR headline* OR cover* OR syndicat* OR podcast* OR lede OR scoop* OR editorial OR opinion)	78,357		(ChatGPT OR GPT-3.5 OR GPT-3.5T OR "GPT-3.5 turbo" OR GPT-4 OR GPT-4T OR "GPT-4 turbo") w/25 (journal* OR news*)	4,255		
45	34	(impact* w/5 assess*) w/25 ("gpt" OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR genai OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure)	44	N/A				
46	35	("gpt" OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR genai) w/5 metric*	2,512	N/A				
47								
48		Section E: Terms Relating to Technical Documentation and Processes						
49	36	(reward OR policy) w/10 model*	18,701	N/A				
50	37	(few OR one OR zero) w/10 shot*	27,764	N/A				
51	38	(training OR stag* OR layered) w/5 (learn* OR iteration OR cycle OR batch OR epoch OR curve)	21,245	N/A				
52	39	"model completion"	705	N/A				
53	40	data w/25 scrap*	5,539	N/A				
54	41	("validation data" OR "The Pile" OR preprocessing OR "test set" OR "training set" OR "evaluation set" OR "text extraction" OR "semantic analysis" OR "source attribution") w/25 (discriminator OR curricular OR classif* OR "score" OR frequen* OR contamination* OR duplicat* OR regression* OR cluster* OR feature* OR label* OR attribute* OR categ* OR value* OR variable* OR inference OR distillation OR recipe*)	3,756	N/A				
55	42	("validation data" OR "The Pile" OR preprocessing OR "test set" OR "training set" OR "evaluation set" OR "text extraction" OR "semantic analysis" OR "source attribution") w/25 (rule* OR guidance* OR weight* OR perplexity OR ROUGE OR F1 OR classif* OR benchmark OR whitelist OR blacklist OR safeguard* OR guardrail* OR quality OR recitation* OR scrap* OR checkpoint)	1,676	N/A				
56	43	KPI OR PRD OR (performance w/25 indicator)	73	N/A				
57	44	KPI OR PRD OR (performance w/25 indicator)	73	N/A				
58	45	measur* w/5 pipe* (model w/25 card) OR "product brief" OR "product requirement" OR "data card" OR datasheet OR "data doc**	130	N/A				
59	46	(product* OR design* OR technical OR architecture OR system* OR launch*) w/10 (specification* OR requirement* OR brief* OR report* OR chart OR log) embed* w/15 (function OR space OR vector OR index* OR indices)	430	N/A				
60	47	relevance OR "query tuning" OR (source* w/5 (trust* OR credib*)) OR (standard* w/5 editor*) OR (criteri* w/5 (exclusion OR inclusion))	42,250	N/A				
61	48		9,855	N/A				
62	49		15,904	N/A				
63	50		1,299	N/A				
64	51	Azure AND compute* (journal* OR news* OR report* OR info* OR knowledge OR article* OR story OR stories OR publish* OR headline* OR cover* OR syndicat*) AND ((data* w/5 quality) OR (high w/5 quality))	20,934		Azure AND ("super computer" OR supercomputer)	1,335		
65	52		34,433		dataset* w/10 "high quality"	14,570		
66								
67		Section F: Terms Relating to Collaboration with Microsoft						
68								
69	53		13,675	N/A				
70	54		834	N/A				
71	55	crecendo	167	N/A	(Microsoft OR MSFT) AND ("super computer" OR supercomputer)	2,675		
72	56	mail(*@microsoft.com) AND (data* OR train* OR "gpt" OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR generative OR Genai OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR "compute")	13,645		mail(*@microsoft.com) AND (train* w/10 (data* OR material* OR source*))	151		
73	57		3,719	N/A				
74	58	MS w/25 (data* OR train*)						
75		Section G: Search Terms Related to the Market for and Value of Content						
76	59	(*Licens* OR agreement* OR compensat* OR pay OR paid) AND (*gpt* OR dv3 OR dv-3 OR davinci-3 OR genai OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure OR Prometheus OR Orchestrat*)	46,947	N/A				
77	60	(license OR agreement) AND (train* w/15 model*)	6,127	N/A				
78	61	(public* OR "open source" OR "creative commons" OR government OR 1920 OR 1921 OR 1922 OR 1923 OR 1924 OR 1925 OR 1926 OR 1927 OR 1928) w/25 ("gpt" OR dv3 OR genai OR generative OR SLM OR Bing OR Copilot OR Azure)	16,071	N/A				

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
1		The Times's Proposed Search Terms	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		OpenAI's Initial Search Term Proposal	Total Documents Hit by Term Including Families		Court's Ruling
2	Unique, De-duplicated Hit Counts for all Terms Combined		546,902			131,601		
79	62	(MAI OR MAI-1 OR Phi OR Phi-2 OR Phi-3) w/50 (azure OR CPU OR GPU OR compute* OR invest* OR financ* OR profit* OR revenue* OR stake OR money OR process* OR server* OR hardware)	515	N/A	(MAI OR MAI-1 OR Phi OR Phi-2 OR Phi-3) AND azure	699		
80	63							
81								
82	Section H: Search Terms OpenAI Seemingly Re-Used from Other Cases							
83								
84	64				Libgen* OR "Library Genesis"	4,748		
85	65				"books corpus" OR (book* w/5 corp*) OR bookscorp*	2,721		
86	66				Gutenberg	3,111		
87	67				z-library OR zlibrary OR zlib	1,287		
88	68				"Google books"	1,698		
89	69				B-ok	1,077		
90	70				"Open Library"	1,520		
91	71				book* w/5 ("data quality" OR "high quality")	174		
92	72				smashwords	1,188		
93	73				Bibliotik	18		
94	74				"Anna's Archive"	11		
95					Sci-Hub OR scihub OR "sci hub"	342		